



A JOINT AADCP II AND ASEAN SECRETARIAT STUDY

NATIONAL IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MUTUAL RECOGNITION ARRANGEMENT (MRA) ON TOURISM PROFESSIONALS: SUCCESS STORIES AND BEST PRACTICES



Success Stories and **Best Practices**
from **Cambodia** and **Indonesia**

© AADCP II

ASEAN – Australia Development Cooperation Program – Phase II
Supporting ASEAN in establishing the ASEAN Economic Community by 2015

Post address

The ASEAN Secretariat
Jl. Sisingamangaraja 70A
Jakarta 12110 – Indonesia

Phone: +62 21 726 2991
Fax: +62 21 7278 7252
Email: info@aadcp2.org

Website

<http://www.aadcp2.org>

The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed herein are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the ASEAN Secretariat or the Australian Government.



Preface and Acknowledgements

'National Implementation of the Mutual Recognition Arrangement (MRA) on Tourism Professionals: Success Stories and Best Practices from Cambodia and Indonesia' is the result of collaboration between the ASEAN Secretariat and the Australian Agency for International Development (AusAID) through the ASEAN-Australia Development Cooperation Program (AADCP) Phase II.

The report has been produced for **ASEAN Member States** (AMSs), to share lessons about how Cambodia and Indonesia have implemented the Regional MRA on Tourism Professionals at country level, so this may inform and advance the efforts of other AMSs.

It is also intended for **Cambodia and Indonesia**, to assist in telling their story of progress and achievements to date, and to provide an advocacy tool to further their MRA efforts – in partnership with government, hotels, training providers, industry and industry associations.

Finally, it is provided for **AusAID**, as a means of accountability and to demonstrate how Australia's support to ASEAN tourism is contributing to increased mobility of Tourism Professionals in ASEAN; key to establishing the ASEAN Economic Community 2015.

In summary - we trust this report will fulfill its aims to in some way assist other ASEAN Member States to advance their efforts, help Cambodia and Indonesia themselves in their further progress, and demonstrate to AusAID the value of its investment.

'National Implementation of the MRA on Tourism Professionals: Success Stories and Best Practices from Cambodia and Indonesia' was led by Tamara Haig, DevDAS (Consultant). Guidance in developing the framework, scope, approach, and assistance with logistics for this Study, as well as reviews of early versions of this Study report was provided by Ms. Irene Wijaya, AADCP II (M&E/Communications Officer), Ms. Cornelia H. Wiryasti, AADCP II (Senior Program Officer) and Mr. Eddy Krismeidi, ASEAN Secretariat (Senior Officer, Tourism Unit, Infrastructure Division).

The team received valuable support and guidance throughout this Study from AMS' Country Focal Points for Indonesia, Ms. Ani Insani and for Cambodia, Mr. Try Chhiv. Our special thanks also go to AMS stakeholders for so freely giving their time to share their stories, successes and challenges, and their commitment to creating competency-based training of tourism professionals across the ASEAN region. Please see this full list of stakeholders met and consulted in Annex 1.

This Study and accompanying Report was made possible by the generous assistance and funding from the ASEAN-Australia Development Cooperation Program (AADCP) Phase II - through AusAID. It is complemented by the sister report, ***'Gap Analysis on Implementation of MRA on Tourism Professionals'*** (William Angliss Institute).

Acronyms & Abbreviations

AADCP II	ASEAN – Australia Development Cooperation Program Phase II
ACCSTP	ASEAN Common Competency Standards for Tourism Professionals
ADB	Asian Development Bank
AEC	ASEAN Economic Community
AFD	Agence Française de Développement (French Development Agency)
AMS	ASEAN Member State
ASEAN	The Association of Southeast Asian Nations
ASEC	The Association of Southeast Asian Nations Secretariat
ATPMC	ASEAN Tourism Professional Monitoring Committee
ATPRS	ASEAN Tourism Professional Registration System
ATSP	ASEAN Tourism Strategic Plan (2011-15)
AusAID	Australian Agency for International Development
BOD	Board of Directors
CATA	Cambodian Association of Travel Agents
CATC	Common ASEAN Tourism Curriculum
CBT	Competency Based Training
CHA	Cambodian Hotel Association
CRA	Cambodian Restaurant Association
F/O	Front Office
F&B	Food and Beverage
GA	Gap Analysis
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GM	General Manager
H/K	Housekeeping
Hildiktipari	Himpunan Lembaga Pendidikan Tinggi Pariwisata Indonesia (Indonesian Association of Higher Education Institutions, Tourism)
HITT	SNV's High Impact Tourism Training Program
HR	Human Resource
IAPSD	Indonesia Australia Partnership for Skills Development Program
ILO	International Labour Organisation
LEPPI	Lembaga Profesional Pariwisata Indonesia (Indonesian Professional Institute of Tourism i.e. Indonesian NTPB)

LSP	Lembaga Sertifikasi Profesi (Professional Certification Institute) (i.e. Indonesian TPCBs)
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MLVT	Cambodian Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training
MoT	Cambodian Ministry of Tourism
MRA	Mutual Recognition Arrangement
MTCE	Indonesian Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy
NCTP	Cambodian National Committee for Tourism Professionals (i.e. Cambodian NTPB)
NGO	Non Government Organisation
NPIC	National Polytechnic Institute of Cambodia
NQF	National Qualifications Framework
NTB	National Training Board
NTPB	National Tourism Professionals Board
Pariwisata	Tourism
PSE	Pour un Sourire d'Enfant Institute (Tourism Training Institute – 'For a Child's Smile)
QF	Qualifications Framework
RQF	Regional Qualifications Framework
RQFSRS	Regional Qualifications Framework and Skills Recognition System
SGU	Swiss German University
SKKNI	Standar Kompetensi Kerja Nasional Indonesia (Indonesian National Occupational Competency Standards)
SNV	Netherlands Development Organisation
STP	Sekolah Tinggi Pariwisata (School of Tourism)
ToA	Training of Assessors
ToT	Training of Trainers
TPCB	Tourism Professionals Certification Board
TQF	Tourism Qualifications Framework
UN	United Nations
UN WTO	United Nations World Tourism Organisation
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
VET	Vocational Education and Training

Table of Contents

FOREWORD	1
An ASEAN Update	2
SUCCESS STORIES	4
Cambodia Success Stories	5
Indonesia Success Stories	7
BEST PRACTICES	9
Cambodia Best Practices	10
Indonesia Best Practices	11
Best Practice Summary	12
ANNEXES	13
Annex 1: Thanks and Acknowledgements: Stakeholders Consulted	13
Annex 2: List of References	14

FOREWORD

'National Implementation of the Mutual Recognition Arrangement (MRA) on Tourism Professionals: Success Stories and Best Practices from Cambodia and Indonesia' showcases the exemplary initiative of Cambodia and Indonesia to push forward the MRA national implementation. This Report explores the impact at country level of AADCP's support, and the process these countries have taken in achieving best practice.

Tourism plays an important role in the ASEAN economy. In 2011, the tourism sector accounted for 4.6% of the ASEAN GDP or US\$ 68.6 million (81 million visitor arrivals in 2010), employing nearly 10 million people or more than 3% of total employment in the region. It is consistently growing. With intra ASEAN travel taking up nearly 50% of international arrivals in the ASEAN countries, a developed tourism industry will boost economic growth and drive change across the region.

It is across these ASEAN Member States (AMSs) - Brunei, Cambodia, Indonesia, Laos, Malaysia, Myanmar, Philippines, Singapore, Thailand and Viet Nam - that the **ASEAN Secretariat** is working to establish the ASEAN Economic Community 2015: One Vision, One Identity, One Community. Critical to this is tourism – a key industry sector in the ASEAN economy – and one that ASEC, with ASEAN Dialogue Partners, supports by implementing the ASEAN Tourism Strategic Plan (2011-15).

Now, **with AADCP II support**, AMSs are developing and implementing Toolboxes for the Tourism Curriculum and Competency Standards, and training Master Trainers and Assessors in the application of these Toolboxes so students can be trained, assessed and certified based on competencies; a key, practical tool in realizing MRA implementation.

What have been Cambodia and Indonesia's successes in implementing the regional level outputs/efforts in this area at a national level? **What best practices** – processes – can help to guide the staged development of other AMSs in this area? These and other questions were asked of government, industry and other stakeholders in Cambodia and Indonesia.

Their answers – from set-up of institutional linkages and collaboration, to promotion of stakeholder participation, and support for policy, legislative and regulatory environment – **are proof of their successes in MRA implementation**. Further, the successes achieved by different stakeholders combine to tell a story of how strong industry and training sector support has built a certification mechanism – in MRA implementation - that is sustainable.

The ASEAN Tourism Professionals Monitoring Committee hopes that by sharing the success stories and best practices from Cambodia and Indonesia, other AMSs will be inspired to fully realise the potential of their own work and efforts. We invite you to share in and be inspired by, these achievements.



I Gusti Putu Laksaguna
Chair

ASEAN Tourism Professionals Monitoring Committee

AN ASEAN UPDATE

MRA Regional Resources

Three resources have underpinned the early MRA framework (2002-2008, via AADCP I):

- ASEAN *Common Competency Standards* for Tourism Professionals (ACCSTP)
- Common ASEAN *Tourism Curriculum* (CATC) and Regional *Qualifications Framework and Skills Recognition System* (RQFSRS)
- Capacity Building initiative for an ASEAN Mutual Recognition Arrangement (MRA) in Tourism (CBAMT)

Five further resources now progress MRA implementation (2009 – current, via AADCP II):

- *Toolbox Development* for Housekeeping and Priority Tourism Labour Division
- *Toolbox Development* for Front Office, F&B Services, Food Production labour divisions
- *Training of Master Trainers and Assessors* for Housekeeping Division
- Feasibility Study to Establish a Regional Secretariat for ASEAN Tourism Professionals
- Gap Analysis on Implementation of MRA on Tourism Professionals

Completed Activities

The **ACCSTP (competency standards)** were completed in 2005. These describe the skills, knowledge and attitude required for 32 job-titles and 242 competency units in the primary divisions of hotel and travel of the tourism sector. The **CATC (curriculum)** was developed based on the ACCSTP and completed in 2008. It outlines the competency standard, promoting uniformity and consistency of tourism training programs across ASEAN Member States. The **RQFSRS (qualifications framework)** was developed by 2008 as a common yardstick for AMSs to set up accreditation for tourism qualifications and skills recognition.

Many AMSs will combine National Qualification Frameworks to develop a Tourism QF. Trainings and workshops for key stakeholders were also conducted to ensure that the characteristics and the operational benefits contained in the ACCSTP Framework and standards are appropriately recognised and socialised.

These resources are available for AMS to establish national level tourism competency standards, curriculum and qualifications framework, meeting the ASEAN agreed standard.

Current and Future Indicative Activities

Toolboxes for priority tourism labour division: **Housekeeping** & Common Core competences have recently been completed, which will enable institutions to apply the ACCSTP and CATC to train, assess and certify students based on the competences.

The toolboxes are standard CBT materials for Certificate II to Advance Diploma level training and assessment. The next toolboxes to be developed will be for **Front Office, Food and Beverage, Food Production**, followed by **Travel Agent** and **Tour Operation** labour divisions. A total of 242 toolboxes would have been developed by 2015, each corresponding to the 242 competency units described in the ACCSTP.

A series of regional **Training of (Master) Trainers (ToT) and (Master) Assessors (ToA)** will follow, for representatives from AMS to learn how to use the toolboxes for training and assessment. Training began in November 2012, with further training planned for 2013 and 2014. At the end of this training, at least 180 ASEAN Master Trainers and Master Assessors will be available to train across the region and to establish a pool of qualified trainers and assessors in each AMS.

The availability of toolboxes and pool of trainers and assessors in each AMS will allow each country to develop its own national competency standards, curriculum and tools based on an ASEAN standard, and ultimately, to train, assess and certify tourism students based on competencies.

As identified in the ATSP, a regional secretariat is considered necessary to support the work of the ASEAN Tourism Professional Monitoring Committee (ATPMC) in overseeing the implementation of the MRA.

The feasibility study on the establishment of this Regional Secretariat is currently ongoing, as well as a **Gap Analysis (GA)** on Implementation of MRA on Tourism Professionals' which identifies gaps and opportunities in each AMS to fully implement the MRA, and recommends follow-up actions.

These activities will be complemented by future activities, which may include capacity building for government, educational institutions and the private sector as well as raising awareness on the MRA on Tourism Professionals.

Once complete, these projects will guide AMSs in advancing their MRA implementation, and guide the ASEAN Tourism Professional Monitoring Committee (ATPMC) in establishing an oversight body/ infrastructure to monitor MRA implementation.

SUCCESS STORIES

Why is national implementation of the regional MRA on Tourism Professionals – and Cambodia and Indonesia’s successes – important?

ASEAN Member States (AMSs) share a common commitment to achieving an integrated ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) by 2015. Ten years ago ASEAN leaders signed the ASEAN Tourism Agreement – supporting ASEAN’s vision for a free flow of tourism services. Central to the AEC vision – and service delivery in foreign markets - is the movement and mobility across markets by tourism professionals. Tourism, a labour-intensive services industry, is therefore one of 12 priority sectors selected for accelerated ASEAN integration.

However, differences in tourism Vocational Education and Training (VET) standards and disparities in the tourism labour market across AMSs in the region hamper the free flow of professionals and economic opportunities. To address this, the ASEAN Tourism Strategic Plan (2011-15) sets out a strategy to implement **Mutual Recognition Arrangements (MRAs)** on Tourism Professionals (signed by ASEAN Tourism Ministers on 29 January, 2010). With news of the final AMS – Thailand – signing this in November 2012, ASEAN is now in a position to fully implement the Agreement (an extension of the Arrangement).

The MRA is a long-term effort. In Australia for example, this process has taken 15+ years. In ASEAN, the aim is to realise and fully implement the MRA by 2015. To aid in this, since 2004 Australia has been working with ASEAN – via **AADCP** - to support AMSs to achieve their vision, through the development of tools, materials and training for AMS representatives that bring their country Tourism Professionals to a common ASEAN competency standard.

Certifying ASEAN tourism professionals will enable AMSs to achieve cross recognition of professional standards, and enable a freer flow of labour mobility and trade in the region. **Tourism professionals** will benefit through improved job prospects, salary, a professional pathway, and intra-regional opportunities. **Hotels** will benefit through an increased cadre of quality, trained staff, improving the consistency and quality of service, and customer experience. **Tourism schools** in AMSs will benefit through higher graduate employment rates of qualified, accredited and certified tourism professionals, in demand by industry.

Also, improved labour mobility of tourism professionals within ASEAN benefits sustainable economic development in the region; both an ASEAN and a **key AusAID strategic goal**. It also promotes opportunities for all, an AusAID strategic goal, through empowering women’s education and economic participation. AusAID are the only ASEAN Dialogue Partners funding MRA Implementation for Tourism Professionals at the regional level.

In benchmarking progress achieved to date, we can **learn from Cambodia**, where strong Government support to build national laws, regulations, infrastructure and engage through training providers has shown strong early results. We can also learn from Indonesia, where their applied competency standards, curriculum and toolboxes since 2003 have resulted in positive stakeholder collaboration in CBT practice including with private sector.

There are also lessons to be learned in promoting opportunities for women. Tourism is a particularly important sector for **women**. In addition to creating, for example, 32 gender neutral job titles in the regional ACCSTP competency standards (aligned to UN WTO standards), there are practical examples from Cambodia and Indonesia that show the potential that full MRA implementation could make for women’s economic status in AMSs.

UNED-UK (1999). Report: Gender & Tourism: Women’s Employment and Participation in Tourism.

Cambodia Success Stories

Cambodia has a relatively small population with 14 million people (UN 2010). In tourism, it ranks 109 of 139 countries in the World Travel and Tourism Competitiveness Index (2010). However, international visitor arrivals have increased four-fold since 2003 (to 2.8 million p.a.2011)), with almost 1 in 2 from the ASEAN region (NCTP 2012). Cambodia's services exports grew more than 20% p.a. for 10 years led by a rapid expansion in tourism (World Bank 2012).



Overview

Since the signing of the MRA, Cambodia has made significant inroads in to implementing the MRA: applying the regional tourism competency standards, curriculum, piloting in tourism schools the toolboxes released to date.

The commitment of the Cambodian government has engendered enthusiasm from key industry partners. Their efforts to apply MRA regional resources have clear benefits; matching industry demand for more professional graduates that can cater for higher expectations of service quality among increasing tourist arrivals.

Context

Cambodia began applying the ASEAN competency standards and curriculum from 2011, following the signing of the MRA on Tourism Professionals. It began with little or no enabling infrastructure. In just two years, Cambodia has set-up the necessary laws, regulations and required infrastructure, and been disseminating MRA materials to its 11 VET institutions, industry and key development partners. It has kept pace with the rollout of ASEAN regional resources and training.

Successes

In 2011, Cambodia **established tourism infrastructure**, namely the NTPB (known as NCTP with accompanying laws and regulations) and its website (for upload of ASEAN materials and workshop updates, but also as a precursor to/model for an ATPRS – that will support future plans for a Regional Secretariat). It also created a manual, CD and printed versions for the ACCSTP and CATC

material (including translations into Khmer): a case study in good practice.

To drive **awareness of the MRA** i.e. ACCSTP and CATC, NCTP has distributed translated materials to training providers, and public-private sectors, and has also held eight workshops in 2012 in four key regions, reaching close to 2,000 people.

NCTP's proactive approach to and **engagement with development partners** has helped to sustain MRA implementation. Partners such as ILO, SNV and ADB have assisted in applying and rolling out the ACCSTP and CATC.

Support from training institutions has also been a key ingredient in Cambodia's implementation of MRA regional resources. For example, PSE Institute and Sala Bai have been enthusiastic in applying the ACCSTP and CATC in their courses: a pilot/model school approach.

The further **adoption of MRA regional materials** through industry collaboration has provided valuable lessons from implementation for Cambodia's MoT. For example, SNV's HITT program has applied 60-70% of the ACCSTP, CATC and Housekeeping toolbox and is eager to apply upcoming ASEAN toolboxes.

Summary

Some key successes for Cambodia have included: establishing **tourism infrastructure, laws and regulations** including website; **development partner engagement; training institution support; adoption of regional materials.**

Feature 1: Government Infrastructure

Cambodia's **government coordination** and set-up of its National Tourism Professionals Board (**NTPB**) (known as NCTP) and soft infrastructure (**website**) provides valuable lessons for AMSs. All ASEAN MRA materials are uploaded, and workshop details updated on the site. It was also set up as a precursor to/model for an ATPRS and could support future plans for a Regional Secretariat.

Ministry of Tourism (MoT) established NCTP in 2011, an NCTP Action Plan (2011-15) and built its Secretariat to 15 staff in 2 years. NCTP has enjoyed strong Government support and in 2011 lobbied and negotiated – after detailed review of Ministries' regulations and documents - to convince Ministries of the ASEAN regional integration merits of MRA and NCTP.

Resulting **laws/regulations** include:

- Law (NCTP Secretariat): 1/2011
- Sub-Decree (NCTP): 9/2011
- Decision (NCTP BOD): 34/2011

NCTP Secretariat (Dir.): Mr. Try Chhiv

NCTP Planning Div.: Mr. Mean Vandet

Feature 2: Development Partner Engagement

MoT (via NCTP) has been proactive in seeking support from **development agencies and other partners** to implement the MRA; a good case study. The effort has helped integrate the spirit of MRA into the strategic plans of these partners, including UN agencies, schools and the private sector.

ILO has helped to implement the ASEAN competency standards in Cambodia and may assist with rolling out the ASEAN standards and Master Training/Assessing. **ADB** supports tourism training as one of four priorities for Cambodia's economic integration.

AFD (French Development Agency) may fund MoT's national tourism school plans in 2013.

ILO: Mr. Sophorn Tun; Mr. Nuon Rithy

SNV HITT: Ms. Saya Marta

Feature 3: Training Institution Support

In the past 10 years as tourist arrivals and job opportunities have increased, Cambodia's training institutes have had increased demand for qualified graduates.

Pour un Sourire d'Enfant Institute (**PSE** Institute) has been enthusiastic in supporting MRA implementation; volunteering to pilot the ACCSTP and CATC. They have applied these and partnered with hotels such as Intercontinental, Raffles, Sunway to provide practical work experience for their approx. 150+ graduates p.a. who have 100% employment rates.

Note: Demand for tourism training in Cambodia is high, with approx. 8,000 applicants p.a. competing for 1,500 places across 11 VET institutions. To meet forecast demand for 800,000 tourism professionals in Cambodia by 2020, MoT plans to build a national tourism school.

PSE Institute Director: Mr. La Vibol

PSE Vice Dean – Hosp.: Mr. Sro Rithy

NCTP Secretariat (Dir.): Mr. Try Chhiv

Feature 4: Adoption of Regional Materials

There is a high **uptake of regional** materials from key MoT partners. MoT has assisted, including by translating the ACCSTP and CATC into Khmer.

Since 2011, SNV's HITT program has been applying 60-70% of the Cambodia-applied ACCSTP and CATC (and H/K Toolbox) in its program to train 1,300 Cambodians in the tourism sector. SNV is eager to apply the upcoming ASEAN Food & Beverage toolbox from 2013 through its program. HITT also has three models for industry collaboration that includes Cooperation Agreements with 1-3 Star Hotels who then employ their qualified trainees.

SNV HITT: Ms. Saya Marta

Indonesia Success Stories

Indonesia is a highly populous nation; it has the largest population amongst AMSs with 245 million people (UN 2010). In tourism, it ranks 74 of 139 countries in the World Travel and Tourism Competitiveness Index (2010). Of Indonesia's annual visitor arrivals in 2012, 8 million are international, arriving across Indonesia's 13 international airports, while 240 million are domestic travelers (97% of all tourists) (MTCE 2012).



Overview

Indonesia has a largely aligned tourism curriculum, competency standards and qualifications framework to the ASEAN regional standards (i.e. the ACCSTP, CATC and the RQFSRS).

Of note, Indonesia has also taken a strong leadership role, as Chair of the ASEAN Technical Task Force on Manpower, and now as current Chair of the ASEAN Tourism Professionals Monitoring Committee (ATPMC).

Context

Indonesia began developing its national competency standards (SKKNI), national curriculum and qualifications framework, including for tourism, in 1998 – 2003 with assistance from the Indonesia Australia Partnership for Skills Development (IAPSD) Program.

Indonesia has contributed significantly to developing the ASEAN MRA regional resources: its SKKNI for tourism - along with occupancy skills standards from four other AMSs (Malaysia, Singapore, Philippines, Thailand) - was submitted and became the basis for the regional ACCSTP (2004).

Successes

The Government's commitment to **establishing tourism infrastructure** that supports MRA implementation can be seen as a best practice model. This includes setting up its National Tourism Professional Board (NTPB or LEPPI) and its Tourism Professional Certification Board (TPCB or LSPs). It also includes enacting laws, and passing regulations and decrees that require industry and tourism schools' MRA implementation.

This infrastructure in turn, has been crucial in **creating awareness** of MRA resources. Cooperation between the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy (MTCE) and LEPPI has developed **industry** and provincial level stakeholders to become familiar with and appreciate the benefits of the MRA.

Further, this level of industry collaboration has helped to inform the Indonesian and regional standards. For example, government tourism schools – such as STP Bandung, Bali, Makassar and Medan - private STPs, and industry including hotels, have joined MTCE to create standardised materials and a tiered certification system.

Indonesia has successfully harmonized its resources for tourism competency standards and tourism curriculum to the regional resources i.e. ACCSTP and CATC. For example, a 2009 **mapping exercise** matched over 80% of the ACCSTP and CATC content with Indonesia's SKKNI for tourism, and a 2012 review by STP Bandung showed a 94% match across a sample job role of 36 competency units.

As a result, there has been a strong uptake and **adoption of regional materials**. For example, centers of excellence such as STP Bandung have developed new tourism training programs based on the CATC; piloting these from 2010 to date.

Summary

Some key successes for Indonesia have included: establishing **tourism infrastructure, laws and regulations; creating awareness of the MRA; industry collaboration; and adoption of regional materials**.

Feature 1: Tourism Infrastructure

The Government's commitment in setting up the National Tourism Professionals Board (**NTPB**) and Tourism Professionals Certification Board (**TPCB**) – required under the MRA (2009) – is best practice.

Indonesia's NTPB (known as **LEPPI**, the accreditation body) is funded by MTCE and was established in 2009, while the TPCB (known as LSPs (now 10 in Indonesia) was set-up in 2004. These **LSPs** are located across Indonesia, to reflect training needs across Indonesia's sprawling geography. They are industry-led and set up for independent funding.

LSPs have 400+ workplace assessors (60% are women) and have certified 40,000 tourism professionals since 2010 (above trend for MTCE's target of 50,000 certified professionals by 2014).

TPCB/LSP Jakarta: Ms. Ida Trisnasari
TPCB/LSP Nusantara: Mr. Imam Hudaya
NTPB/LEPPI: Mr. Soedihartono, MTCE

Feature 2: Creating Awareness

MTCE's work with LEPPPI in **creating awareness of the MRA** – its principles and benefits – and MTCE's support through **laws and regulations** in Indonesia, provides useful lessons.

MTCE set-up LEPPPI as a permanent working group. Together, they have visited 30 of 34 Indonesian provinces twice since 2008, providing 3,000+ stakeholders with MRA materials. LSP Bandung also acts as a reference and 'leads' in the dissemination of materials.

Key **laws/regulations** enacted include:

- Law of Tourism (NTPB): 10/2009
- Government Regulation: 52/2012
- Min. Decree (Qualifications): 8/2012

MTCE, Head **APTMC**: Mr. Putu Laksaguna
MTCE, Head **Competency**: Ms. Ani Insani

Feature 3: Industry Collaboration

Indonesia uses tiered certification (1st/2nd/3rd party) to meet industry demand, and industry collaborations that draw on hotels' practical training facilities to meet MRA requirements.

This includes **industry collaboration** by MTCE with private and government funded schools to **standardise** materials, and via certification, with schools such as STP Bandung certifying students to a certain level, then hotels certifying higher levels – therefore sharing responsibility.

Sahid Hotel, Cikarang has its own LSP Cikarang (one of Indonesia's 10) that has certified over 8,200 professionals. Of the 19 Indonesian Sahid Hotels, all GMs are certified, as are 60-70% of employees.

To meet demand for quality staff, Sahid also has a private school with SKKNI and CBT-trained graduates; STP Sahid. It also partners with five star Datai Hotels in Malaysia: 10% of its 600 students gain work experience there each year.

Sahid Hotel: Mr. Rachmad Sugiyanto
STP Sahid: Mr. Kusmayadi Kusmayadi

Feature 4: Adoption of Regional Materials

There has been broad, consistent application of Competency Based Training (**CBT**) – and accompanying **uptake and use of regional materials** - in vocational education and training institutions.

STP Bandung, the 1st tertiary tourism school in Indonesia – whose alumni include senior industry leaders - was established under the Ministry of Tourism in 1962. It has become known as a 'centre of excellence' and since 2010 has been developing and trialling a new tourism course based on the ASEAN CATC.

STP Bandung: Ms. Kerti Utami

BEST PRACTICES

What best practices – processes – can help to guide the staged development of other AMSs in this area?

Collectively, at the **ASEAN Regional level**, a number of success factors have marked good progress towards MRA implementation. For example AMSs have managed most progress in: ensuring training facilities aid in the effective delivery of CBT and training in the priority tourism labour divisions; and attracting and retaining suitable tourism trainers.

In other areas, **AMSs' staged development** in reaching near full MRA implementation with 'no gaps' or 'small gaps' will benefit from understanding the processes underpinning best practice in other AMSs: such as in Cambodia and Indonesia.

By **Success Factors**; useful experiences to draw on for most AMSs:

1. Building awareness of the MRA – its principles and benefits
2. Setting up of National Tourism Professional Board (NTPB) and Tourism Professional Certification Board (TPCB)
3. Building awareness of, and uptake and use of, ASEAN tourism toolboxes
4. Coordinating government impetus to assist in the implementation of the MRA

Best Practices from Cambodia and Indonesia that could be applied by most AMSs:

1. Setting-up of institutional linkages and collaboration. This has been crucial, for example in the establishment of the NTPB and TPCB in Indonesia, and the NTPB in Cambodia.
2. Promoting Stakeholder Participation. This has been critical, for example for Cambodia and Indonesia in building awareness of the MRA and uptake of resources
3. Establishing support for Policy, Legislative and Regulatory Environment. This has been significant in Cambodia and Indonesia's coordination of Government impetus.
4. Building private (or public) sector support for a sustainable certification mechanism for MRA Implementation. This has been usefully applied by Indonesia in creating a tiered independent system (1st, 2nd, 3rd party) for certification, including via workplaces.

In AMSs, tourism provides various entry points for **women's employment**, income generation and economic security. In many AMSs, women make up 50% of the services industry, although labour force participation rates are often less among women than men.

For example, in Cambodia, SNV HITT program's Inception Research (finalised July 2012) found the greatest challenges and also opportunities to access VET in the tourism sector for people in the informal economy, are for: mostly illiterate, adult women (for Housekeeping roles); and for youth (both men and women, for F&B or wait staff roles).

For example, **gender specific strategies for MRA implementation** could mean that MRA-led initiatives level the playing field for women, i.e. by seeking equal qualifications (and pay) in tourism for women, developing women as trainers, providing training for women, and encouraging women to take tourism leadership roles, including in industry. Such measures could improve the likelihood of women's more equal access to the benefits of MRA implementation in AMSs.

William Angliss Institute (2012) for AADCP. **Confidential. Draft Interim Report: Gap Analysis on Implementation of MRA on Tourism Professionals**. Provided in confidence.

ADB (2012). Key Indicators for Asia and the Pacific 2012. Sample statistics: Indonesia (2011) Labour force participation rate 84.3% (male) and 52.4% (female). Cambodia (2004). Labour force participation rate 78.9% (male) and 70.7% (female).

Cambodia Best Practices

Cambodia has shown a strong will and commitment to adopt the MRA on Tourism Professionals and was the first AMS to establish an NTPB with government support. Cambodia began with little or no enabling infrastructure in place to implement the MRA on Tourism Professionals, yet now has strong links and partnerships with industry, donor agencies and private sector collaboration, and is proactive and enthusiastic in making industry aware of MRA products, progress and activities.



AMSs may find some of Cambodia's best practices useful to apply in MRA implementation:

1. Ensuring early government coordination with other ministries

Cambodia took a best practice approach in its year-long process to set-up the NTPB (known as NCTP). MoT staff undertook early, detailed reviews of **Ministries of Education, and Labour and Vocational Training** laws/regulations. This enables MoT staff to lobby and negotiate for the necessary legislation and regulations to set-up NCTP and its activities.

2. Establishing working groups and taking a pilot approach to implementation

By setting up working groups, Cambodia was able to gain early momentum in **piloting the ACCSTP and CATC** in tourism training schools. In June 2012, NCTP set-up a 23-person public-private Technical Task Force; they initiated the H/K toolbox trial with model schools PSE and Sala Bai (September 2012), and have supported MRA awareness.

3. Taking a proactive approach to engaging partners and donors

Cambodia took a proactive approach to engage partners and development agencies. **Finding mutual priority areas**, NCTP has tailored its work program to implementing and rolling out the MRA: ILO has assisted with technical advice supporting the ACCSTP; SNV has trialled the ACCSTP, CATC and H/K toolbox in its program.

4. Clearly communicating the benefits of MRA to stakeholders

In Cambodia, NCTP took considerable effort to translate all key **laws and regulations** (and competency units) into both English and Khmer, finding stakeholders more readily accepted the resources. Their set-up of a website is also best practice: uploading ASEAN MRA materials and workshop details online quickly has seen over 26,000 visits in two years.

5. Identifying options for dissemination of resources

Cambodia has found that engaging other government **ministries and private sector** (including industry associations such as CRA and CHA, and training schools) in its structures including its NCTP Board, and Technical Task Force, has improved dissemination of MRA resources. To drive awareness of the MRA, NCTP has also held workshops in four key regions.

6. Establishing regulations that enable MRA implementation

Ministries of Tourism in AMSs can enable MRA implementation by establishing laws and regulations. In Cambodia, MoT enacted an early Law that enabled the **set-up of the NCTP** Secretariat. Following this, the NCTP was able to establish a sub-decree regarding its **Board and activities**, and further, establish and **fund** its own **Action Plan** (2011-15).

Indonesia Best Practices

Indonesia has been an active participant in the regional push for MRA implementation, it is currently Chair of the ASEAN Tourism Professionals Monitoring Council (ATPMC) and much of the regionally agreed MRA on Tourism Professionals reflects Indonesia's own tourism curriculum, accreditation and certification infrastructure. It does not have a government-only lead approach to MRA implementation (distinct from other AMSs). It is well prepared to fully implement the MRA on Tourism Professionals by 2015.



AMSs may find some of Indonesia's best practices useful to apply in MRA implementation:

1. Establishing working groups with shared responsibility

To achieve **industry support in implementing** MRA resources, MTCE drew on existing working groups. Hildiktipari – the Indonesian Association of Higher Education Institutions, Tourism - assessed regional materials, coordinated with members and applied these in MTCE government tourism schools of STP Bandung, Bali, Makassar and Medan. AMSs could take a similar approach.

2. Using existing networks to promote awareness of the MRA

Indonesia's MTCE with Indonesia's NTPB (i.e. LEPPPI) draws on **industry associations and multiple stakeholders** – from training providers, industry, associations – to promote MRA awareness. AMSs could consider a similar approach: regular consultations, with multiple stakeholders, across 30 of 34 provinces since 2009.

3. Setting up a centre of excellence at country level

As the 1st MTCE tourism school in Indonesia (est. 1962), STP Bandung is seen as a centre of excellence. By first establishing a school as a centre of excellence, then drawing on an association training schools (such as Hildiktipari), other AMSs could use such a **mechanism to also share best practice MRA tourism standards and curriculum**.

4. Clearly communicating the benefits of MRA to stakeholders

AMSs can clearly explain the benefits of implementing MRA resources as Indonesia's MTCE has done. For example: **tourism professionals** benefit through improved job prospects; hotels benefit through an increased cadre of quality staff; tourism schools benefit through higher graduate employment rates.

5. Using a multi-tiered certification approach

Indonesia's multi-tiered certification approach enables a shared school (student) to work-place (existing professional) certification system. Other AMSs could consider a similar approach, through industry-led and independently funded LSPs, such as in Indonesia, where they are dispersed geographically, making it **easier to gain certification** across Indonesia's archipelago.

6. Establishing regulations that enable MRA implementation

By passing laws or regulations, AMSs could also **gain improved** industry implementation of the MRA. For example, MTCE's 2009 Law on Tourism and 2012 Government Regulations: made tourism competency standards and certifications compulsory; regulated licenses to tourism assessment places; and established the need for a qualifications framework.

Best Practice Summary

A number of best practices – processes – are driving successful MRA implementation at a national level. These drivers also show areas where AMSs could improve through staged development. The following demonstrate some best practices that may be usefully applied.

1. Ensuring early **government coordination** with other ministries
In many AMSs, various government ministry portfolios concern MRA implementation such as Ministries of Tourism, Education, Labour, and Immigration. Early engagement and coordination with these Ministries can be beneficial.
2. Establishing **working groups** with shared responsibility
AMS working groups for MRA implementation could cooperate by sharing responsibility in assessing regional materials, and coordinate communication with stakeholders including hotels, training institutions, donors and NGOs.
3. Using existing **networks to promote awareness** of the MRA
Ministries of Tourism in AMSs could usefully draw upon industry associations and working groups to promote MRA awareness, including in disseminating resources.
4. Taking a **proactive approach to engaging** partners and donors
AMSs can build support at a national level for the measures required to implement the MRA. For example, donors or partners can provide technical support or trials.
5. Setting up a **center of excellence** at country level
AMSs can benefit from engaging and drawing out and setting up centers of excellence at a country level. For example, tourism schools that take a leadership approach could undertake early pilots or trials of MRA standards or toolboxes.
6. Clearly **communicating the benefits** of MRA to stakeholders
Good awareness of the benefits of the MRA builds acceptance and adoption at the AMS level. It is important to clearly communicate the benefits to each stakeholder group such as students, schools, hotels and industry (particularly important)
7. Taking a **pilot approach to implementation**, when needed
Consider a staged approach to implementation at AMS level. Assess partner readiness and select partners as pilot projects for early implementation. This could include partners such as tourism schools, select hotels, or donor training programs.
8. Identifying options for **dissemination of resources**
AMSs could develop innovative collaborations between hotels, schools and government. For example, government could engage via industry venues to circulate standards information, and engage in regional areas through industry associations.
9. Using a **multi-tiered certification approach**
Taking a stepped approach to certification reduces the burden on schools, and enables readily applicable certification to existing tourism professionals in their workplaces. This complements schools' capacity and industry demand.
10. **Establishing regulations** that enable MRA implementation
Establishing regulations can enable AMSs to ensure standardised materials are applied at schools and employers support employees in gaining certification.

ANNEXES

Annex 1. Thanks and Acknowledgements: Stakeholders Consulted

We record our appreciation and thanks to all those who met with us during our visits for sharing their time, valuable insights and advice. In particular, we thank:

- Ms. Irene Wijaya, **AADCP II** (M&E/Communications Officer), Ms. Cornelia H. Wiryasti, AADCP II (Senior Program Officer) and Mr. Eddy Krismeidi, **ASEAN Secretariat** (Senior Officer, Tourism Unit, Infrastructure Division), for guidance in developing the framework, scope, approach, and assistance with logistics for this Study, as well as reviews of early versions of this report.
- **ASEAN Member States'** Country Focal Points for Indonesia, Ms. Ani Insani and for Cambodia, Mr. Try Chhiv, for their valuable support and guidance throughout this Study in recognising the importance of the Study, and identifying and securing the commitment of key stakeholders for their participation in the Study.

Our special thanks go to **ASEAN Member States' stakeholders** for so freely giving their time – through consultations/Workshops (on 5 November in Phnom Penh, and on 8 November in Jakarta) and individual meetings/site visits. This Report is possible thanks to:

In Cambodia:

- **Country Focal Point** (note: is also Government): Secretariat of National Committee for Tourism Professionals (NCTP) in Ministry of Tourism (MoT) (i.e. Cambodia's National Tourism Professional Board (NTPB))
- **Government:** International Cooperation and ASEAN Department, Education Training Department, and Tourism Industry Department, in Ministry of Tourism (MoT)
- **Tourism training providers:** Pour un Sourire d'Enfant Institute (PSE Institute); National Polytechnic Institute of Cambodia – Faculty of Tourism & Hospitality (NPIC) (note: NPIC is within Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MLVT))
- **Industry:** Cambodian Association of Travel Agents (CATA)
- **Donors/supporting partners:** International Labour Organisation (ILO); Netherlands Development Organisation's High Impact Tourism Training Program (SNV's HITT Program).

In Indonesia:

- **Country Focal Point** (note: is also Government): Competency Centre, Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy (MTCE)
- **Government:** Lembaga Profesional Pariwisata Indonesia (LEPPI) in Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy (MTCE) (i.e. Indonesia's National Tourism Professional Board (NTPB))
- **Certification body:** Lembaga Sertifikasi Profesi (LSP) Pariwisata Jakarta; LSP Pariwisata Nusantara (i.e. Two of Indonesia's 10 independent Tourism Professional Certification Bodies (TPCBs))
- **Tourism training providers:** Sekolah Tinggi Pariwisata (STP) Bandung; STP Sahid (i.e. Two of over 20 Indonesian vocational (tertiary) tourism training institutes) (note: STP Bandung is one of four within Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy (MTCE)). Swiss German University – Department of BA for Hotel and Tourism Management (SGU)
- **Industry:** Sahid Hotel, Cikarang; Parklane Hotel; Human Resource (HR) Manager Association
- **Donor/ASEAN Dialogue Partner:** Regional Program, AusAID Indonesia.

ANNEXES

Annex 2. List of References

ASEAN Secretariat (ASEC) (2011). **ASEAN Tourism Strategic Plan (2011-2015)**.

Accessed: <http://www.aseansec.org/documents/ATSP%202011-2015.pdf>

ASEAN – Australia Development Cooperation Program (AADCP) – Phase II (2012 a). **Draft AADCP II Outcome Monitoring Tool (Monitoring & Evaluation Framework) for Tourism Projects Cluster.**

- (2012 b). An overview of AADCP II support to the implementation of MRA on tourism professionals. Fact Sheet: **Increasing Mobility of Tourism Professionals in ASEAN**. Accessed: <http://aadcp2.org/home/files.php?key=35>
- (2012 c). Supporting The ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) » Services » Increasing Mobility of Services Professionals. An overview of current AADCP II Tourism Projects: **Increasing Mobility of Services Professionals**. Accessed: <http://aadcp2.org/home/focusarea.php?id=6>
- (2012 d). Supporting The ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) » Services » Increasing Mobility of Services Professionals » Toolbox Development For Housekeeping Tourism Labour Division. An overview of current AADCP II Tourism Project: **Toolbox Development For Housekeeping Tourism Labour Division**. Accessed: <http://aadcp2.org/home/project.php?id=16>
- (2012 e). Supporting The ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) » Services » Increasing Mobility of Services Professionals » Training of ASEAN Master Trainers & Assessors for Housekeeping Division. An overview of current AADCP II Tourism Project: **Training of ASEAN Master Trainers & Assessors for Housekeeping Division**. Accessed: <http://aadcp2.org/home/project.php?id=31>
- (2012 f). Supporting The ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) » Services » Increasing Mobility of Services Professionals » Gap Analysis on Implementation of MRA on Tourism Professionals. An overview of current AADCP II Tourism Project: **Gap Analysis on Implementation of MRA on Tourism Professionals**. Accessed: <http://aadcp2.org/home/project.php?id=33>
- (2012 g). Supporting The ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) » Services » Increasing Mobility of Services Professionals » Feasibility Study for the Establishment of a Regional Secretariat for Tourism Professionals. An overview of current AADCP II Tourism Project: **Feasibility Study for the Establishment of a Regional Secretariat for Tourism Professionals**. Accessed: <http://aadcp2.org/home/project.php?id=32>
- (2006). Supporting The ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) » Publication & Reports » AADCP Archive » AADCP Phase I. An overview of past AADCP I Tourism Project: **Developing ASEAN Common Competency Standards for Tourism Professionals** (370-015). Accessed: <http://aadcp2.org/home/archives.php?mod=detail&id=100>
- (2008 a). Supporting The ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) » Publication & Reports » AADCP Archive » AADCP Phase I. An overview of past AADCP I Tourism Project: **Developing Common ASEAN Tourism Curriculum Project** (370-022). Accessed: <http://aadcp2.org/home/archives.php?mod=detail&id=100>
- (2008 b). Supporting The ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) » Publication & Reports » AADCP Archive » AADCP Phase I. An overview of past AADCP I Tourism Project: ***Capacity Building for an ASEAN Mutual Recognition Arrangement in Tourism Project** (370-023). Accessed: <http://aadcp2.org/home/archives.php?mod=detail&id=100>

ANNEXES

Cambodia's Secretariat of National Committee for Tourism Professionals (NCTP) in Ministry of Tourism (MoT) (Country Focal Point and NTPB) (July 2012). **Implementation of ASEAN Mutual Recognition Arrangement on Tourism Professionals (MRA)**: Presentation by Try Chhiv, Secretariat Director of NCTP to AMSs, Intercontinental Hotel, 20 July 2012.

- (2011 a). **Sub-decree (No. 9 ARNKR.BK) on the Establishment of the National Committee for Tourism Professionals (NCTP)**, 10 January 2011.
- (2011 b). **Decision (No. 34 SSR) on the Appointment of the National Committee for Tourism Professionals' (NCTP) Composition**, 8 June 2011.
- (2011 c). **Prakas (Law) on the Organisation and Functioning of the Secretariat of the National Committee (No. 001 PRK.NCTP) for Tourism Professionals (NCTP)**, 2011.
- (2010). **ASEAN Mutual Recognition Arrangement (MRA) on Tourism Professionals**, 2010.

Cambodia's Statistics and Tourism Information Department in Ministry of Tourism (MoT) (November 2012). **Tourism Statistics Report: July 2012**

European Commission (EC) (2008). **Changing the world... locally: 25 success stories of development cooperation at local level**. Accessed: http://ec.europa.eu/development/icenter/repository/Success-Stories_EN_FIN.pdf

Indonesia's Competency Centre in Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy (MTCE) (2012 a) (Country Focal Point). **NTPB Indonesia and TPCB Indonesia**: Presentation by Ms. Ani Insani, Head of Competency Centre in MTCE to AMSs, Hotel Sheraton Mustika, Yogyakarta, 19 September 2012.

- (2012 b). Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 52 Tahun 2012 Tentang Sertifikasi Kompetensi dan Sertifikasi Usaha di bidang Pariwisata (**Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 52 Year 2012 About Competency and Certification efforts in the field of Tourism**).

Indonesia's Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy (MTCE) (2012 a). Statistik Wisatawan Nusantara 2007-12 (**Indonesian Traveler Statistics, 2007-12**)

- (2012 b). Kerangka Kualifikasi Nasional Indonesia (KKNII) (**Indonesia's National Qualifications Framework**): Jenjang Pendidikan Formal dan Jenjang Pendidikan Nonformal, Informal, Pelatihan, Pengalaman (**Formal Education Studies and Non-formal, Informal, Training and Experience Education Studies**).
- (2012 c). Contoh Klaster Kompetensi Berdasarkan Jabatan (**Sample Competency-Based Cluster by Title**). With reference to ACCSTP.

National Committee for Tourism Professionals (NCTP), Cambodia (2012).

Information regarding the NCTP. Accessed: <http://www.cambodiatourismprofessionals.gov.kh/>

Sekolah Tinggi Pariwisata (STP) Bandung (2012). Skema Sertifikasi Kompetensi (**Competency Certification Scheme**): Supervisor Food and Beverages. Of all Job Titles and 36 associated Indonesian SKKNI Competency Units, 34 competency units (94%) cross-check with ACCSTP competency units in a mapping exercise. With reference to ACCSTP. 17 September 2012.

ANNEXES

UN Millennium Campaign (2010). **MDGs Success Stories from Asia and the Pacific: Accelerating Achievement of the MDGs**. Accessed: http://www.undp.org/fj/pdf/MDG%20Success%20Stories%20AP_web.pdf

William Angliss Institute (2012) for AADCP. **Confidential. Draft Interim Report: Gap Analysis on Implementation of MRA on Tourism Professionals**. Provided in confidence.

World Bank Operations Evaluation Department (OED) (1997). **Precis: Best Practices Paper(s)**. Accessed: [http://lnweb90.worldbank.org/oed/oeddoclib.nsf/DocUNIDViewForJavaSearch/861A072402A3DA86852567F5005D900F/\\$file/156precis.pdf](http://lnweb90.worldbank.org/oed/oeddoclib.nsf/DocUNIDViewForJavaSearch/861A072402A3DA86852567F5005D900F/$file/156precis.pdf)

World Bank (2012). **ASEAN Economic Community 2015: Opportunities and Challenges for Cambodia's Trade in Services**: Opening Remarks by Alassane Sow, World Bank, The Sofitel Phnom Penh Phokeethra Hotel, 23-24 October 2012.



AADCP II

ASEAN - Australia Development Cooperation Program - Phase II



**Australian
AID** 